

Korespondensi Publikasi

Criminalizing the Freedom of Expression by State during COVID-19 Pandemic in Indonesia

Laksanto Utomo

Universitas Sahid, Jakarta, Indonesia

International Journal of Criminal Justice Science Vol 16 Issue 2 July – December 2021

- Pendaftaran akun ke jurnal: 10 Maret 2021: [IJCJS] [Confirmation Required]
Notification about your account creation at ManuscriptLink
- Submit Paper: 10 Maret 2021; [IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission
- Submit Paper: 12 Maret 2021; [IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission
- Keputusan Editor: 12 Juni 2021: [IJCJS] Editor Decision
- Submit Revisi: 1 Agustus 2021: [IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission
- Keputusan Editor: 6 September 2021: [IJCJS] Editor Decision
- Submit Revisi: 25 September 2021: [IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission
- Keputusan Editor: 11 Oktober 2021: [IJCJS] Editor Decision



Laksanto Utomo <laksanto@gmail.com>

[IJCJS] [Confirmation Required] Notification about your account creation at ManuscriptLink

1 message

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: Laksanto Utomo <laksanto@gmail.com>

Wed, Mar 10, 2021, at 06:15 AM

Dear Dr. Laksanto Utomo,

This mail is to let you know that your account (Signin ID: laksanto@gmail.com) was created at the online manuscript submission and peer-review system of *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

[NOTE] Before starting to use ManuscriptLink service, you need to confirm your email address (signin ID) by clicking the link below:

<https://www.manuscriptlink.com/user/confirm/1e3514eb9fa24d43bba7f2e10153a8e9>

Through the following link, you can access the online manuscript submission and peer-review system of *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs?id=laksanto@gmail.com>

In the ManuscriptLink online system,

- * If you are an author of manuscript, you can submit a manuscript and keep a close watch over the on-going review process including the review history of past manuscripts.
- * If you are a manager of a journal, you can create and manage a new journal submission and review service, and customize your service according to the demand of editorial members.
- * If you are an editorial member of a journal, you can manage a review process for a submitted manuscript and enhance the academic value of the journal by accepting or rejecting publication of submitted manuscripts.
- * If you are a reviewer of a journal, you can evaluate a submitted manuscript and send your review report to editorial members of the journal.

Best regards,

ManuscriptLink Support Team
Email: support@manuscriptlink.com
<https://www.manuscriptlink.com>

Terms of Service and Privacy Policy
Terms of Service : <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/docs/termsOfService>
Privacy Policy: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/docs/privacyPolicy>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail



Laksanto Utomo <laksanto@gmail.com>

IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission

1 message

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>

Wed, Mar 10, 2021, at 11:25 AM

To: Laksanto Utomo <laksanto@gmail.com>

Dear Dr. Laksanto Utomo,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Criminalizing the Freedom of Expression by State during COVID-19 Pandemic in Indonesia

Author(s): Laksanto Utomo

Corresponding Author: Laksanto Utomo

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Sahid, Jakarta, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 10-Mar-2021 (UTC)

In a couple of days, a confirmation e-mail including the manuscript ID will be again forwarded to you when the journal manager looks through your submission and confirms it. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail



Laksanto Utomo <laksanto@gmail.com>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

1 message

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>

Fri, Mar 12, 2021, at 12:30 PM

To: Laksanto Utomo <laksanto@gmail.com>

Dear Dr. Laksanto Utomo,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Criminalizing the Freedom of Expression by State during COVID-19 Pandemic in Indonesia

Author(s): Laksanto Utomo

Corresponding Author: Laksanto Utomo

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Sahid, Jakarta, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 10-Mar-2021 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-15-2021

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail



Laksanto Utomo <laksanto@gmail.com>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

1 message

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: Laksanto Utomo <laksanto@gmail.com>

Sat, Jun 12, 2021, at 09:15 AM

Dear Dr. Laksanto Utomo,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*, "Criminalizing the Freedom of Expression by State during COVID-19 Pandemic in Indonesia".

Our decision is: Revisions Required

Please revise your manuscript based on reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month.
Let me know if you have any questions.

Best

Journal Editor-in-Chief
International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences
Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====
This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail

Reviewer- A

Decision: Major revisions required

The study "*Criminalizing the Freedom of Expression by State during COVID-19 Pandemic in Indonesia*" adopted a justificatory approach within the normative and juristic regulations and found that a state categorized the right to free speech as a vehicle of crime during the periods of crisis like the COVID pandemic, hence criminalized all free expressions in media and in the public domain and imposed limitation on the Freedom of expression. It also recommends repealing the Indonesian Electronic Information and Transactions (EIT) Law, particularly Article 127, which considers all free expressions as defamation and hate speeches. Although the authors used good material and arguments to build their case, however, overall, there are a few things that need step-wise improvement to make this work publishable.

In the introduction of the paper, the authors should briefly present the laws and regulations associated with Freedom of expression. The statement "Indonesia has always supported the protection of freedom of expression as a privilege to be enjoyed by all individuals in a civil society" needs more justification and explanation. Also, the authors should explain in detail how and why, during the pandemic, it was imperative and mandatory for all Indonesian people to participate and follow COVID-

appropriate behavior.

Throughout the literature review section, the authors used similar research results to the existing research without logical arguments. That weakens the arguments, and the current arguments are not persuasive enough to convince the readers that this paper has contributions. So please rewrite this section. Also, add subheadings like *Freedom of expression as a democratic principle*, etc.,

The problem statement is well-written and explained by the authors. Since the framework of the study is derived from the fundamental liberal principle. It needs more clarity and literature support.

The results are very brief and need to be more detailed, clearly articulating ideas and extracting information.

The discussion is also presented well. However, there is still room for improvement. There is a need to explain Rawls (2005) defines public interest in the context of the justification of limitations on Freedom of expression.

Although the article is well-written and easy to read, it has some grammatical errors that must be carefully checked and corrected.

Authors should add DOIs for all the references as per journal requirements.

Reviewer -B

Decision: Major revisions required

- A. The introduction of the topic is very brief. A detailed introduction is required to better understand the research gap and research problem. Also, authors should add laws and regulations linked with Freedom of expression in the country.
- B. The literature review needs to be much more clearly written. The ideas are there, but they need to be explained further, and the ideas need to be more clearly linked together. An in-depth literature review is required to build the arguments with a clear understanding of the main concepts.
- C. I encourage the authors to share some more details regarding the study context in the problem statement.
- D. The discussion section is merged with the conclusion part. There is a need to discuss the study results in detail independent of the conclusion, clearly stating the significance of the results and their applicability as per the study context. A separate conclusion section must be added at the end.
- E. There are many grammatical issues in the article throughout, and the authors are especially confused about where to use and where not to use “articles” and commas, singular or plural, etc.



Laksanto Utomo <laksanto@gmail.com>

[IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission

1 message

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: Laksanto Utomo <laksanto@gmail.com>

Sun, Aug 01, 2021, at 11:57 AM

Dear Dr. Laksanto Utomo,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track
Criminalizing the Freedom of Expression by State during COVID-19 Pandemic in Indonesia
Author(s): Laksanto Utomo
Corresponding Author: Laksanto Utomo
Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Sahid, Jakarta, Indonesia
Date of Manuscript Submission: 10-Mar-2021 (UTC)
The manuscript ID: IJCJS-15-2021

We have confirmed and forwarded your revision submission for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief
International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences
Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====
This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail

RESPONSE TO REVIEWER-A

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	The study "Criminalizing the Freedom of Expression by State during COVID-19 Pandemic in Indonesia" adopted a justificatory approach within the normative and juristic regulations and found that a state categorized the right to free speech as a vehicle of crime during the periods of crisis like the COVID pandemic, hence criminalized all free expressions in media	Thanks very much, dear reviewer, for your kind remarks and for allowing me to revise the manuscript. I tried my best to revise the whole paper.

	and in the public domain and imposed limitation on the Freedom of expression. It also recommends repealing the Indonesian Electronic Information and Transactions (EIT) Law, particularly Article 127, which considers all free expressions as defamation and hate speeches. Although the authors used good material and arguments to build their case, however, overall there are a few things that need step-wise improvement to make this work publishable.	
1.	In the introduction of the paper, the authors should briefly present the laws and regulations associated with Freedom of expression. The statement "Indonesia has always supported the protection of freedom of expression as a privilege to be enjoyed by all individuals in a civil society" needs more justification and explanation. Also, the authors should explain in detail how and why, during the pandemic, it was imperative and mandatory for all Indonesian people to participate and follow COVID-appropriate behavior.	Dear reviewer, I have revised the introduction. I have also explained the statement Indonesia has always supported the protection of Freedom of expression as a privilege to be enjoyed by all individuals in a civil society. Also, we explained how and why, during the pandemic, it was imperative and mandatory for all Indonesian people to participate and follow COVID-appropriate behavior. Please see pages 2-4
2.	Throughout the literature review section, the authors used similar research results to the existing research without logical arguments. That weakens the arguments, and the current arguments are not persuasive enough to convince the readers that this paper has contributions. So please rewrite this section. Also, add subheadings like Freedom of expression as a democratic principle, etc.,	Dear reviewer, Many thanks for your kind suggestions and comments. I have now revised the literature review portion with logical arguments. Also, added subheadings like Freedom of expression as a democratic principle, etc., Please see pages 4-9
3	The problem statement is well-written and explained by the authors. Since the framework of the study is derived from the fundamental liberal principle, it needs more clarity and literature support.	Dear reviewer, Many thanks for your kind comments. Following your kind guidelines, I have now added more details for the fundamental liberal principle. Please see pages 10-11
4	1- The results are very brief and need to be more detailed, clearly articulating ideas and extracting information.	Dear reviewer, Many thanks for your kind comments. I have added more detailed, clearly articulating ideas and extracting information. Please see pages 11-12
5	The discussion is also presented well. However, there is still room for improvement. There is a need to explain Rawls (2005) defines public interest in the context of the justification of limitations on Freedom of expression.	Dear reviewer, many thanks for your kind guidelines. I have thoroughly revised and explained the said arguments and statements. Please see pages 13-14
6	Although the article is well-written and easy to read, it has some grammatical errors that must be carefully checked and corrected.	Proof editing is done as per kind suggestion
7	Authors should add DOIs for all the references as per journal requirements.	Thanks very much, dear reviewer, for your kind remarks and for allowing me to revise the

		manuscript. I tried my best to revise the whole paper.
--	--	--

RESPONSE TO REVIEWER-B

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
		Thanks a lot, dear reviewer, for allowing me to revise the manuscript. I am very grateful for all the good and valuable comments. These helped us a lot to improve our work.
1.	The introduction of the topic is very brief. A detailed introduction is required to better understand the research gap and research problem. Also, authors should add laws and regulations linked with Freedom of expression in the country.	Dear reviewer, I have revised the introduction to make it influential. Following your kind guidelines, I have added laws and regulations linked with Freedom of expression in the country. Please see pages 2-4
2.	The literature review needs to be much more clearly written. The ideas are there, but they need to be explained further, and the ideas need to be more clearly linked together. An in-depth literature review is required to build the arguments with a clear understanding of the main concepts.	Dear reviewer, following your kind guidelines, I have thoroughly revised the literature review and moderation hypothesis with the latest studies. Please see pages 5-9
3	I encourage the authors to share some more details regarding the study context in the problem statement.	Dear reviewer, following your kind guidelines, I have added details regarding the study context in the problem statement. Please see pages 10-11
4	The discussion section is merged with the conclusion part. There is a need to discuss the study results in detail independent of the conclusion, clearly stating the significance of the results and their applicability as per the study context. A separate conclusion section must be added at the end.	Dear reviewer, many thanks for your kind guidelines. I have revised the discussion section and added a separate conclusion section at the end of the manuscript. Please see page 16
5	There are many grammatical issues in the article throughout, and the authors are especially confused about where to use and where not to use "articles" and commas, singular or plural, etc.	Dear reviewer, I am grateful for your observations and for helping us enhance our manuscript's quality with your kind suggestions, comments, and guidelines. Following your kind guidelines, I have now proof-edited our paper with the help of professional native English speakers to enhance its quality and readability



Laksanto Utomo <laksanto@gmail.com>

[IJCS] Editor Decision

1 message

IJCS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: Laksanto Utomo <laksanto@gmail.com>

Mon, Sep 06, 2021, at 12:23 PM

Dear Dr. Laksanto Utomo,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*, "Criminalizing the Freedom of Expression by State during COVID-19 Pandemic in Indonesia".

Our decision is: Revisions Required

Please revise your manuscript based on reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month.

Let me know if you have any questions.

Best

Journal Editor-in-Chief
International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences
Homepage: <https://www.ijcs.com>

=====[Note]=====
This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail



Laksanto Utomo <laksanto@gmail.com>

[IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission

1 message

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>

Sat, Sep 25, 2021, at 08:44 AM

To: Laksanto Utomo <laksanto@gmail.com>

Dear Dr. Laksanto Utomo,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Criminalizing the Freedom of Expression by State during COVID-19 Pandemic in Indonesia

Author(s): Laksanto Utomo

Corresponding Author: Laksanto Utomo

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Sahid, Jakarta, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 10-Mar-2021 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-15-2021

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission revision for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail



Laksanto Utomo <laksanto@gmail.com>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

1 message

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>

Mon, Oct 11, 2021, at 01:34 PM

To: Laksanto Utomo <laksanto@gmail.com>

Dear Dr. Laksanto Utomo,

Congratulations! the following of your manuscript.

Track: Regular Track

Criminalizing the Freedom of Expression by State during COVID-19 Pandemic in Indonesia

Author(s): Laksanto Utomo

Corresponding Author: Laksanto Utomo

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Sahid, Jakarta, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 10-Mar-2021 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-15-2021

Has been accepted for publication in *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences* (Vol. 16 No. 2, 2021). Thank you for your interest in our journal.

Your Journal paper would be indexed in Scopus (Elsevier), Google Scholar, Scirus, GetCited, Scribd, so on.

We look forward to receiving your subsequent research papers.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail
