



ariyani nafiah <arienafiah@gmail.com>

[Sustainability] Manuscript ID: sustainability-2137861 - Ethical Questions Confirmation

Sustainability Editorial Office <sustainability@mdpi.com>
Reply-To: lesliee.chen@mdpi.com
To: Nafiah -- Ariyani <arienafiah@gmail.com>
Cc: Sustainability Editorial Office <sustainability@mdpi.com>

Mon, Dec 19, 2022 at 3:08 PM

Dear Dr. Ariyani,

I am writing to you because your manuscript, Pathways toward transformation of sustainable rural tourism management: The Case Central Java Rural Tourism Indonesia of sustainability-2137861, describes research on humans or animals, but does not include information regarding Ethics Committee or Institutional Review Board approval.

Please note that approval is necessary in order for your manuscript to be accepted for possible publication, and we would be grateful if you could provide us with the corresponding information at your earliest convenience.

Ethic Committee Name:
Approval Code:
Approval Date:

More information can be found at <https://www.mdpi.com/ethics>

Should Ethics Committee or Institutional Review Board approval not be required for your manuscript, please provide an explanation and be aware that we might ask for further supporting documentation.

Kind regards,
Mr. Leslie Chen
E-Mail: lesliee.chen@mdpi.com

--
MDPI Beijing Office Tongzhou, Jincheng Center, Room 2207, Tongzhou District,
China

MDPI Sustainability Editorial Office
St. Alban-Anlage 66, 4052 Basel, Switzerland
E-Mail: sustainability@mdpi.com
<http://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability>



ariyani nafiah <arienafiah@gmail.com>

[Sustainability] Manuscript ID: sustainability-2137861 - Submission Received

Editorial Office <sustainability@mdpi.com>
Reply-To: sustainability@mdpi.com
To: Nafiah -- Ariyani <arienafiah@gmail.com>
Cc: Akhmad Fauzi <akhmadfauzi@apps.ipb.ac.id>

Mon, Dec 19, 2022 at 9:47 AM

Dear Dr. Ariyani,

Thank you very much for uploading the following manuscript to the MDPI submission system. One of our editors will be in touch with you soon.

Journal name: Sustainability
Manuscript ID: sustainability-2137861
Type of manuscript: Article
Title: Pathways toward transformation of sustainable rural tourism management: The Case Central Java Rural Tourism Indonesia
Authors: Nafiah Ariyani *, Akhmad Fauzi
Received: 19 December 2022
E-mails: arienafiah@gmail.com, akhmadfauzi@apps.ipb.ac.id
Submitted to section: Tourism, Culture, and Heritage,
https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/sections/culture_and_heritage
Tourism Management and Sustainable Development: Transformations, Challenges and Opportunities in a Changing World
https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/special_issues/sustai_tourismchaning

You can follow progress of your manuscript at the following link (login required):

https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/ec53c534fde539054dd5524b06ec1528

The following points were confirmed during submission:

1. Sustainability is an open access journal with publishing fees of 2000 CHF for an accepted paper (see <https://www.mdpi.com/about/apc/> for details). This manuscript, if accepted, will be published under an open access Creative Commons CC BY license (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>), and I agree to pay the Article Processing Charges as described on the journal webpage (<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/apc>). See <https://www.mdpi.com/about/openaccess> for more information about open access publishing.

Please note that you may be entitled to a discount if you have previously received a discount code or if your institute is participating in the MDPI Institutional Open Access Program (IOAP), for more information see <https://www.mdpi.com/about/ioap>. If you have been granted any other special discounts for your submission, please contact the Sustainability editorial office.

2. I understand that:

a. If previously published material is reproduced in my manuscript, I will provide proof that I have obtained the necessary copyright permission. (Please refer to the Rights & Permissions website: <https://www.mdpi.com/authors/rights>).

b. My manuscript is submitted on the understanding that it has not been published in or submitted to another peer-reviewed journal. Exceptions to this rule are papers containing material disclosed at conferences. I confirm that I will inform the journal editorial office if this is the case for my manuscript. I confirm that all authors are familiar with and agree with submission of the contents of the manuscript. The journal editorial office reserves the right to contact all authors to confirm this in case of doubt. I will provide email addresses for all authors and an institutional e-mail

address for at least one of the co-authors, and specify the name, address and e-mail for invoicing purposes.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact the Sustainability editorial office at sustainability@mdpi.com

Kind regards,
Sustainability Editorial Office
St. Alban-Anlage 66, 4052 Basel, Switzerland
E-Mail: sustainability@mdpi.com
Tel. +41 61 683 77 34
Fax: +41 61 302 89 18

*** This is an automatically generated email ***



ariyani nafiah <arienafiah@gmail.com>

[Sustainability] Manuscript ID: sustainability-2137861 - Accepted for Publication

Sustainability Editorial Office <sustainability@mdpi.com>

Fri, Jan 27, 2023 at 9:21 AM

Reply-To: Lesliee Chen <lesliee.chen@mdpi.com>, Sustainability Editorial Office <sustainability@mdpi.com>

To: Nafiah -- Ariyani <arienafiah@gmail.com>

Cc: Akhmad Fauzi <akhmadfauzi@apps.ipb.ac.id>, Sustainability Editorial Office <sustainability@mdpi.com>, Lesliee Chen <lesliee.chen@mdpi.com>

Dear Dr. Ariyani,

Congratulations on the acceptance of your manuscript, and thank you for submitting your work to Sustainability:

Manuscript ID: sustainability-2137861

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: Pathways toward the transformation of sustainable rural tourism management in Central Java, Indonesia

Authors: Nafiah Ariyani *, Akhmad Fauzi

Received: 19 December 2022

E-mails: arienafiah@gmail.com, akhmadfauzi@apps.ipb.ac.id

Submitted to section: Tourism, Culture, and Heritage,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/sections/culture_and_heritage

Tourism Management and Sustainable Development: Transformations, Challenges and Opportunities in a Changing World

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/special_issues/sustai_tourismchanginghttps://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/ec53c534fde539054dd5524b06ec1528

We will now edit and finalize your paper, which will then be returned to you for your approval. Within the next couple of days, an invoice concerning the article processing charge (APC) for publication in this open access journal will be sent by email from the Editorial Office in Basel, Switzerland.

If, however, extensive English edits are required to your manuscript, we will need to return the paper requesting improvements throughout.

We encourage you to set up your profile at SciProfiles.com, MDPI's researcher network platform. Articles you publish with MDPI will be linked to your SciProfiles page, where colleagues and peers will be able to see all of your publications, citations, as well as other academic contributions.

We also invite you to contribute to Encyclopedia (<https://encyclopedia.pub>), a scholarly platform providing accurate information about the latest research results. You can adapt parts of your paper to provide valuable reference information, via Encyclopedia, for others both within the field and beyond.

Kind regards,

Yani Li

E-Mail: yani.li@mdpi.com

--

MDPI Tianjin Office 170 North Road, Room 1804, Block A, Lujiazui Financial Plaza, Hongqiao District, China

MDPI Sustainability Editorial Office

St. Alban-Anlage 66, 4052 Basel, Switzerland

E-Mail: sustainability@mdpi.com<http://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability>



ariyani nafiah <arienafiah@gmail.com>

[Sustainability] Manuscript ID: sustainability-2137861; doi: 10.3390/su15032592. – Promotion Tips

sustainability@mdpi.com <sustainability@mdpi.com>

Wed, Feb 1, 2023 at 2:20 PM

Reply-To: lesliee.chen@mdpi.com

To: arienafiah@gmail.com, fauziakhammad@gmail.com

Cc: sustainability@mdpi.com, lesliee.chen@mdpi.com

Dear Authors,

Congratulations! Your manuscript has been published open access in Sustainability.

Thank you for choosing our journal. Your article is now publicly and freely available on the journal website. As part of the post-publication process, we encourage you to promote and share your work to increase its visibility, impact, and citations.

Please find the Publication Certificate and a banner for promoting your manuscript here (please note, this is only available to corresponding authors when logged into their account):

https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/ec53c534fde539054dd5524b06ec1528

To promote the discoverability, views, and downloads of your manuscript you can promote your manuscript in the following ways:

(1) Social Media

- Share your article on various social networks, such as Researchgate, Sciprofiles Facebook, LinkedIn, Mendeley, and Twitter by clicking the share button on the webpage of your article. Please do not forget to tag us, @MDPIOpenAccess so that we can re-tweet your work to further increase its visibility.
- Send a short text (up to 200 characters) to the MDPI assistant editor who was your contact for the publication of your manuscript to post about your manuscript on the journal's Twitter account.
- Write a blog post to explain the meaning and possible outcomes of your Research.
- Ask your institution or society to post your paper on their social media accounts and to include a story about your paper in their newsletters.

(2) Link Share

- Share the article link directly with colleagues and peers in your field.
- Add a link to your article in your email signature.
- Update your personal and institutional websites by adding the title of your article and a link to it.

(3) Academic Research-sharing Platforms

- Set up your profile on academic research-sharing platforms, such as SciProfiles, ResearchGate, Academia.edu, or Google Scholar, and add a summary of your article.
- Register an ORCID author identifier and add the article information to your profile.
- Deposit your article in repositories (such as those run by your university) to make your research more discoverable.

(4) Conferences

- Showcase your publication at conferences in the form of a presentation or a poster. You can find conferences hosted by MDPI to participate in at Sciforum.net.

For additional tips to promote your article please see here:

<https://www.mdpi.com/authors/promoting>

Please keep up with any journal updates and news via our twitter account (https://twitter.com/Sus_MDPI) or LinkedIn page (<https://www.linkedin.com/company/sustainability-mdpi/>).
Find out more about MDPI on our website: <https://www.mdpi.com/about>.

Please keep in touch!

Kind regards,
Sustainability Editorial Office
St. Alban-Anlage 66, 4052 Basel, Postfach, CH-4020 Basel, Switzerland
Tel.: +41 61 683 77 34;
E-Mail: sustainability@mdpi.com
<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability>

Disclaimer: MDPI recognizes the importance of data privacy and protection. We treat personal data in line with the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and with what the community expects of us. The information contained in this message is confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this message in error, please notify me and delete this message from your system. You may not copy this message in its entirety or in part, or disclose its contents to anyone.



ariyani nafiah <arienafiah@gmail.com>

[Sustainability] Manuscript ID: sustainability-2137861 - Ethical Questions Confirmation

ariyani nafiah <arienafiah@gmail.com>
To: lesliee.chen@mdpi.com

Mon, Dec 26, 2022 at 3:32 PM

Dear Leslie Chan
Editor in Charge MDPI

I apologize for being late responding to your request, since I have never had such an issue here in Indonesia. Nevertheless, I will provide a letter of clearance on ethical issue from my institution, ie. University Sahid Indonesia as soon as possible. Since this week is holiday season, it might take some days to have the letter send it to you. I will send it back to you as soon as the letter is ready.

Sincerely

Dr. Nafiah Ariyani
[Quoted text hidden]



ariyani nafiah <arienafiah@gmail.com>

[Sustainability] Manuscript ID: sustainability-2137861 - Funding Information Confirmation

Sustainability Editorial Office <sustainability@mdpi.com>

Fri, Jan 27, 2023 at 9:21 AM

Reply-To: sustainability@mdpi.com, lesliee.chen@mdpi.com

To: Nafiah Ariyani <arienafiah@gmail.com>, Akhmad Fauzi <akhmadfauzi@apps.ipb.ac.id>

Cc: Sustainability Editorial Office <sustainability@mdpi.com>, Leslie Chen <lesliee.chen@mdpi.com>

Dear Authors,

When you submitted, you chose No Funding in the system. Your manuscript has now been accepted. Please carefully check and ensure that the funding information is correct in any places where it appears in your manuscript.

Manuscript ID: sustainability-2137861

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: Pathways toward the transformation of sustainable rural tourism management in Central Java, Indonesia

Authors: Nafiah Ariyani *, Akhmad Fauzi

Received: 19 December 2022

E-mails: arienafiah@gmail.com, akhmadfauzi@apps.ipb.ac.id

Submitted to section: Tourism, Culture, and Heritage,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/sections/culture_and_heritage

Tourism Management and Sustainable Development: Transformations, Challenges and Opportunities in a Changing World

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/special_issues/sustai_tourismchanging

You can check it at:

https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/ec53c534fde539054dd5524b06ec1528

If you have any questions or if you require any modifications, please contact us.

Kind regards,
Submission System



ariyani nafiah <arienafiah@gmail.com>

[Sustainability] Manuscript ID: sustainability-2137861 - Manuscript Resubmitted

Sustainability Editorial Office <sustainability@mdpi.com>

Sun, Jan 29, 2023 at 2:06 PM

Reply-To: Lesliee Chen <lesliee.chen@mdpi.com>, Sustainability Editorial Office <sustainability@mdpi.com>

To: Nafiah -- Ariyani <arienafiah@gmail.com>

Cc: Akhmad Fauzi <akhmadfauzi@apps.ipb.ac.id>

Dear Dr. Ariyani,

Thank you very much for resubmitting the modified version of the following manuscript:

Manuscript ID: sustainability-2137861

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: Pathways toward the transformation of sustainable rural tourism management in Central Java, Indonesia

Authors: Nafiah Ariyani *, Akhmad Fauzi

Received: 19 December 2022

E-mails: arienafiah@gmail.com, akhmadfauzi@apps.ipb.ac.id

Submitted to section: Tourism, Culture, and Heritage,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/sections/culture_and_heritage

Tourism Management and Sustainable Development: Transformations, Challenges and Opportunities in a Changing World

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/special_issues/sustai_tourismchanginghttps://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/ec53c534fde539054dd5524b06ec1528

A member of the editorial office will be in touch with you soon regarding progress of the manuscript.

Kind regards,

Ms. Abby Zhang

Production Editor

E-Mail: abby.zhang@mdpi.com

*** This is an automatically generated email ***



ariyani nafiah <arienafiah@gmail.com>

[Sustainability] Manuscript ID: sustainability-2137861 - Manuscript Resubmitted

Sustainability Editorial Office <sustainability@mdpi.com>

Fri, Jan 20, 2023 at 9:56 AM

Reply-To: Lesliee Chen <lesliee.chen@mdpi.com>, Sustainability Editorial Office <sustainability@mdpi.com>

To: Nafiah -- Ariyani <arienafiah@gmail.com>

Cc: Akhmad Fauzi <akhmadfauzi@apps.ipb.ac.id>

Dear Dr. Ariyani,

Thank you very much for resubmitting the modified version of the following manuscript:

Manuscript ID: sustainability-2137861

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: Pathways toward transformation of sustainable rural tourism

management: The Case Central Java Rural Tourism Indonesia

Authors: Nafiah Ariyani *, Akhmad Fauzi

Received: 19 December 2022

E-mails: arienafiah@gmail.com, akhmadfauzi@apps.ipb.ac.id

Submitted to section: Tourism, Culture, and Heritage,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/sections/culture_and_heritage

Tourism Management and Sustainable Development: Transformations, Challenges and Opportunities in a Changing World

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/special_issues/sustai_tourismchanginghttps://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/ec53c534fde539054dd5524b06ec1528

A member of the editorial office will be in touch with you soon regarding progress of the manuscript.

Kind regards,

Sustainability Editorial Office

Postfach, CH-4020 Basel, Switzerland

Office: St. Alban-Anlage 66, CH-4052 Basel

Tel. +41 61 683 77 34 (office)

E-mail: sustainability@mdpi.com<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/>

*** This is an automatically generated email ***



ariyani nafiah <arienafiah@gmail.com>

[Sustainability] Manuscript ID: sustainability-2137861 - Option to Add ORCID to Your Manuscript

Sustainability Editorial Office <sustainability@mdpi.com>

Sat, Jan 28, 2023 at 9:59 AM

Reply-To: Lesliee Chen <lesliee.chen@mdpi.com>, Sustainability Editorial Office <sustainability@mdpi.com>

To: Nafiah Ariyani <arienafiah@gmail.com>

Cc: sustainability@mdpi.com

Dear Authors,

We have recently sent you a request for final proof-reading of sustainability-2137861. You now have the option to connect your ORCID to the paper via the following link:

<https://susy.mdpi.com/author/orcid/confirm/ec53c534fde539054dd5524b06ec1528>

ORCID is an open, non-profit, community-based effort to provide a registry of unique researcher identifiers and a transparent method of linking research activities and outputs to these identifiers. ORCID is unique in its ability to reach across disciplines, publishers, research sectors, and national boundaries and its cooperation with other identifier systems. The link above allows you to register a new ORCID if you don't already have one.

Best regards,

Ms. Abby Zhang

Production Editor

E-Mail: abby.zhang@mdpi.com



ariyani nafiah <arienafiah@gmail.com>

**[Sustainability] Manuscript ID: sustainability-2137861; doi: 10.3390/su15032592.
Paper has been published.**

sustainability@mdpi.com <sustainability@mdpi.com>

Wed, Feb 1, 2023 at 2:23 PM

Reply-To: leslee.chen@mdpi.com, sustainability@mdpi.com

To: arienafiah@gmail.com, fauziakhammad@gmail.com

Cc: billing@mdpi.com, website@mdpi.com, sustainability@mdpi.com, isa.ye@mdpi.com, abby.zhang@mdpi.com, leslee.chen@mdpi.com

Dear Authors,

We are pleased to inform you that your article "Pathways toward the Transformation of Sustainable Rural Tourism Management in Central Java, Indonesia" has been published in Sustainability as part of the Special Issue Tourism Management and Sustainable Development: Transformations, Challenges and Opportunities in a Changing World and is available online:

Website: <https://www.mdpi.com/2071-1050/15/3/2592>PDF Version: <https://www.mdpi.com/2071-1050/15/3/2592/pdf>

The meta data of your article, the manuscript files and a publication certificate are available here (only available to corresponding authors after login):

https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/ec53c534fde539054dd5524b06ec1528

Special Issue:

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/special_issues/sustai_tourismchanging

Please take a moment to check that everything is correct. You can reply to this email if there is a problem. If any errors are noticed, please note that all authors must follow MDPI's policy on updating published papers, found here: <https://www.mdpi.com/ethics#16>.

To encourage open scientific discussions and increase the visibility of published articles, MDPI recently implemented interactive commenting and recommendation functionalities on all article webpages (side bar on the right). We encourage you to forward the article link to your colleagues and peers.

We encourage you to set up your profile at www.SciProfiles.com, MDPI's researcher network platform. Articles you publish with MDPI will be linked to your SciProfiles page, where colleagues and peers will be able to see all of your publications, citations, as well as your other academic contributions. Please also feel free to send us feedback on the platform that we can improve it quickly and make it useful for scientific communities.

You can also share the paper on various social networks by clicking the links on the article webpage. Alternatively, our Editorial Office can post an announcement of your article on our Twitter channel, please send us a text of up to 200 characters with spaces. Please note that our service Scitations.net will automatically notify authors cited in your article. For further paper promotion guidelines, please refer to the following link: <https://www.mdpi.com/authors/promoting>.

We would be happy to keep you updated about new issue releases of sustainability. Please enter your e-mail address in the box at <https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/toc-alert/> to receive notifications. After issue release, a version of your paper including the issue cover will be available to download from the article abstract page.

To order high quality reprints of your article in quantities of 25-1000, visit: <https://www.mdpi.com/2071-1050/15/3/2592/reprints>

We support the multidisciplinary preprint platform /Preprints/, which permanently archives full text documents and datasets of working papers in

all subject areas. Posting on the platform is entirely free of charge, and full details can be viewed at <http://www.preprints.org>.

We are dedicated to providing an outstanding publishing service, and we invite you to complete our author satisfaction survey <https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/authorfeedbackmdpi>. The survey contains 20 short questions and will only take a couple of minutes to complete.

To help us improve our Production and English editing service, provided as part of MDPI's editorial process, please take a few minutes to participate in the following survey: <https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/38TKGWF> (for Production and English editing service).

Thank you for choosing Sustainability to publish your work, we look forward to receiving further contributions from your research group in the future.

Kind regards,

--

MDPI
Postfach, CH - 4020 Basel, Switzerland
Office: St. Alban-Anlage 66, 4052 Basel, Switzerland
Tel. +41 61 683 77 34
Fax: +41 61 302 89 18
E-mail: website@mdpi.com
<https://www.mdpi.com/>



ariyani nafiah <arienafiah@gmail.com>

[Sustainability] Manuscript ID: sustainability-2137861 - Revised Version Received

Sustainability Editorial Office <sustainability@mdpi.com>

Fri, Jan 20, 2023 at 10:14 AM

Reply-To: lesliee.chen@mdpi.com

To: Nafiah -- Ariyani <arienafiah@gmail.com>

Cc: Akhmad Fauzi <akhmadfauzi@apps.ipb.ac.id>, Sustainability Editorial Office <sustainability@mdpi.com>

Dear Dr. Ariyani,

Thank you very much for providing the revised version of your paper:

Manuscript ID: sustainability-2137861

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: Pathways toward transformation of sustainable rural tourism
management: The Case Central Java Rural Tourism Indonesia

Authors: Nafiah Ariyani *, Akhmad Fauzi

Received: 19 December 2022

E-mails: arienafiah@gmail.com, akhmadfauzi@apps.ipb.ac.id

Submitted to section: Tourism, Culture, and Heritage,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/sections/culture_and_heritageTourism Management and Sustainable Development: Transformations, Challenges
and Opportunities in a Changing Worldhttps://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability/special_issues/sustai_tourismchanginghttps://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/ec53c534fde539054dd5524b06ec1528We will continue processing your paper and will keep you informed about the
status of your submission.

Kind regards,

Mr. Lesliee Chen

E-Mail: lesliee.chen@mdpi.com

--

MDPI Beijing Office Tongzhou, Jincheng Center, Room 2207, Tongzhou District,
China

MDPI Sustainability Editorial Office

St. Alban-Anlage 66, 4052 Basel, Switzerland

E-Mail: sustainability@mdpi.com<http://www.mdpi.com/journal/sustainability>

Reviewers	Responses (Please refer to clean version file Sustainability-2137861-rev-eng-clean)
<p>Reviewer #1</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Can the use and implementation of renewable energy sources, agrovoltatics and modern sustainable development technologies be present and contribute to the development of rural tourism considered by the authors? 2. The authors should disclose and describe the "Multipol" method in more detail. 3. What determines the weight of the criteria in Tables 1, 2 and 3? 4. Apparently there are typos in Table 1 "Reduce population", "Alternatif" in Table 4. 5. The authors should add the section "Directions for further research" and indicate where and how it is planned to implement the results of the work carried out. 	<p>Reviewer #1</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. In the case of area being studied, renewable energy sources, agroviltatics and other modern technologies have not been considered to be implemented since the area is relatively remote area and it considered costly to implement agrivoltaic. 2. This concern has been addressed in the method section 3. Concern has been addressed in line 289 to 295. 4. The typo has been corrected 5. Concern has been addressed in section 5.2 on Future research direction
<p>Reviewer # 2</p> <p>First, the introduction is comprehensive, but it needs to lay out more clearly what the gap in the literature is and what platform does it refer to? This gap can be articulated by proposing a clear research question. The contributions have been laid out in a pretty general manner. Each contribution can be justified using past literature, such as how it is extending this line of research.</p> <p>Second, it seems the paper has relied a lot on academic research papers, which is understandable considering the emergence of</p>	<p>Reviewer # 2</p> <p>The Introduction has been extended and reseracrh questions have been added into the introduction</p> <p>Reference on policy and industries has been added in line 206 to 225.</p>

<p>platforms. A few more articles related to the industry and policy could be added.</p> <p>Third, research methods have been well explained. However, the arguments on Multipol Method (Multicriteria-Policy) are not clear to me and the explanation is not adequate. Please elaborate on this.</p> <p>Fourth, the choice of the data analysis techniques in general and Alternative Scenarios is particular could be elaborated further.</p> <p>Fifth, please justify theoretical contributions using relevant references and clearly showing how they are extending theories. Study findings could be used to back them up. Similarly, practical findings can use industry example to validate research findings.</p> <p>Finally, proper proofreading can improve the quality of the manuscript.</p> <p>Reviewer # 3</p> <p>»English language and style must be improved. some grammatical, format and spelling corrections are needed. Please, check the entire manuscript. For instance: Lines 17-18: please clarify (English problems); Lines 32 and 40: "Mean" : Not "means"; Line 54: "Indonesia is a beautiful country in tourism potential" (it's not clear); Line 133: "policy support, supported (repetition); Line: 430: "managing the complexity of rural tourism management" (repetition: managing and management)</p> <p>» Abstract and Introduction should better present general and specific objectives, in order to highlight what author expects to achieve from this research. The objectives should be aligned with the overall problem being researched and objectives should be enunciated in logical sequence.</p>	<p>The MULTIPOL method has been extended and has been elaborated further</p> <p>Concern has been addressed by extending and elaborating the method as can be seen in line 256 to line 289.</p> <p>Concern has been addressed in section conclusion and research for future direction</p> <p>Proff reading by native speaker has been carried out</p> <p>Reviewer # 3</p> <p>The final version has been proof read by native speakers (see the editing version)</p> <p>Abstract has been revised and includes the objectives of the study both general and specific</p>
---	--

<p>» 'Multipol method' and 'tourism planning' can be included among keywords</p>	<p>Both keywords have been included in the keywords section</p>
<p>» Line 69: Author says: "villages are categorized as a pilot, developing, developed and independent villages" Source typology? Bibliographical reference?</p>	<p>This wording has been rewritten in line 73 to 74. And the Bibliographical reference has been added</p>
<p>» In the context of section "Literature review" see: Lines 160-166: Author gives 2 examples (Hungary and Indonesia). More examples should be given in order to promote discussion./Lines: 189-190: "... One method commonly used in ...is to use SWOT" (attention to "use" repetition)</p>	<p>More examples from other countries has been added as can be seen from line 182 to line 188</p> <p>The wording has been rewritten</p>
<p>» Regarding section "3. Material and Methods", the methods are well chosen. Author says that "Data collection was carried out ..." (lines 226-230). However, the date, number of participants, type of stakeholders [categorised by public/private, community, village (how many stakeholders from each village (author identified 8 villages:)?) ...] and place should also be indicated. Additionally, author presents a set of tables and figures (e.g. table 3. and 4, / and Figure 2) that are a result of FGD. It could be important to be better clarified what is a result (in order to enhance the discussion in the section "4. Results").</p>	<p>The detail of method has been improved, the date, number of participants, type of stakeholders have been included from line 296 to 302</p> <p>Information on Table 3 and 4 have been extended as can be seen in line 330 to 337.</p>
<p>» See Table 1, line "Pollution" Description: Reduce pollution (and not "population")</p>	<p>Tabel 1 has been corrected</p>
<p>» Table 2. The scenario alternatives (leapfrogging) are based in which Bibliographical reference</p>	<p>Table 2 (reference on leapfrogging scenario) has been appended</p>
<p>» Clarify table 5 title: "against"? Source: "Multiple" or "Multipol"?</p>	<p>Table 5 has been corrected</p>
<p>» Line 348: "terrible". Please, consider other classification.</p>	<p>The wording has been replaced</p>
<p>» Figure 9. Source:?</p>	<p>Source of Figure has been written</p>

<p>» The conclusion should be improved (for instance paragraphs 2, 3 and 4 are not clear).</p> <p>» Line 447: "developed coordinated manner"? (English language)</p> <p>» Author should add the study limits and future implications.</p> <p>» References: Corect reference nº 7, 47</p>	<p>The conclusion has been revised and paragraph 2,3 and 4 have been completely rewritten</p> <p>This wording has been rewritten</p> <p>This issue has been addressed in section 5.2 on Future Research Direction</p> <p>» References was been corrected</p>
--	--